STUDENTS' ABILITY AND PROBLEMS IN WRITING REVIEW TEXT AT GRADE XII SMAN 4 KERINCI

THESIS



By

ANAMARYANTI NIM.1103784

Submitted as partial fulfillment of the requirements to obtain Master Degree in Education

ENGLISH EDUCATION SECTION
LANGUAGE EDUCATION PROGRAM
GRADUATE PROGRAM
STATE UNIVERSITY OF PADANG
2014

ABSTRAK

Anamaryanti.2014. Kemampuan Siswa dan Masalah Siswa dalam Menulis Teks Review pada Kelas XII SMAN 4 Kerinci. Tesis. Program Pasca Sarjana. Universitas Negeri Padang.

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui kemampuan siswa dalam menulis review text, masalah-masalah yang dihadapi siswa dalam menulis teks review dan penyebab masalah tersebut. Penelitian ini adalah penelitian deskriptif. Subjek dalam penelitian ini adalah siswa kelas XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci yang terdiri dari 12 siswa laki-laki dan 13 siswa perempuan. Instrumen yang digunakan sebagai alat pengumpulan data dalam penelitian ini adalah berupa data kuantitatif dan data kualitatif. Data kuantitatif diperoleh dari tes menulis yang dilaksanakan di kelas. Data kualitatif dan kualitatif den kualitatif tersebut dikelompokkan berdasarkan indikatornya masingmasing. Hasil dari analisa kuantitatif dan kualitatif diinterpretasikan dan menjadi temuan penelitian.

Dari hasil penelitian, penulis menemukan bahwa kemampuan siswa dalam menulis review adalah cukup. Nilai rata-rata siswa dalam menulis teks review adalah 64,84. Meskipun nilai rata-rata siswa dikategorikan cukup, siswa juga menemukan masalah dalam menulis teks review. Masalah-masalah mereka berhubungan dengan kosa kata, tata bahasa, struktur umum, mengorganisasikan ide dan ejaan serta tanda baca. Temuan juga menunjukkan bahwa penyebab masalah tersebut adalah pengaruh bahasa pertama, bahasa sasaran yang begitu sulit, dan kurangnya pengetahuan siswa tentang komponen dalam menulis teks review.

ABSTRACT

Anamaryanti.2014. Students' Ability and Problems in Writing Review at Grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci. Thesis. Graduate Program. State University of Padang.

This research was aimed to find out the students' ability in writing review text, the students' problems in writing review text and the causes for the problems. The design of research was descriptive. The subject of the research was the students of class XII IPA in SMAN 4 Kerinci which consisted of 12 boys and 13 girls. Instruments used to collect the data in this research are quantitative data and qualitative data. The quantitative data were from the writing test conducted in the class. The qualitative data were from the result of interview done to 25 students. The quantitative and qualitative data were grouped based on the indicators. The result from quantitative analyzing and qualitative analyzing were interpreted to get the result of the research.

From the result of the research, the writer found that the students' ability in writing review text was fair. The average score of the students on writing review text was 64,84. Although the students' ability was fair, the students also found some problems in writing review text; they are: vocabulary, grammar, generic structure, organizing idea and mechanics. It was found that the factors which caused the students' problems were interference of first language, complexity of target language and lack of knowledge about writing components.

PERSETUJUAN AKHIR TESIS

Mahasiswa : ANAMARYANTI

NIM.

: 1103784

Nama

Tanda Tangan

Tanggal

Prof. Dr. Hermawati Syarif, M.Hum.

Pembimbing I

2/2014

Dra. Yenni Rozimela, M.Ed., Ph.D. Pembimbing II

Direktur Program Pascasarjana Universitas Negeri Padang

Prof. Nurhizrah Gistituati, M.Ed., Ed.D.

MP. 19580325 199403 2 001

Ketua Program Studi/Konsentrasi

Dr. Desmawati Radjab, M.Pd.

NIP. 19501231 197703 2 002

PERSETUJUAN KOMISI UJIAN TESIS MAGISTER KEPENDIDIKAN

Tanda Tangan No. Nama Prof. Dr. Hermawati Syarif, M.Hum. 1 (Ketua) 2 Dra. Yenni Rozimela, M.Ed., Ph.D. (Sekretaris) 3 Prof. Dr. H. Anas Yasin, M.A. (Anggota) Dr. Refnaldi, M.Lit. 4 (Anggota) Dr. Ridwan, M.Sc.Ed. 5 (Anggota)

Mahasiswa

Mahasiswa : ANAMARYANTI

NIM. : 1103784

Tanggal Ujian : 4 - 6 - 2014

SURAT PERNYATAAN

Dengan ini saya menyatakan bahwa:

- Karya tulis dengan judul "Students' Ability and Problems in Writing Review Text at Grade XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci" adalah asli dan belum pernah diajukan untuk mendapatkan gelar akademik di Universitas Negeri Padang maupun perguruan tinggi negeri lainnya.
- Karya tulis ini murni gagasan, penilaian dan rumusan saya sendiri tanpa bantuan tidak sah dari pihak lain, kecuali arahan dari Tim Pembimbing dan Tim Penguji.
- 3. Di dalam karya tulis ini tidak terdapat hasil karya atau pendapat yang ditulis atau dipublikasikan orang lain, kecuali dikutip secara tertulis dan dicantumkan sebagai acuan di dalam naskah saya dengan menyebutkan nama pengarangnya dan dicantumkan pada daftar pustaka.
- 4. Pernyataan ini saya buat dengan sesungguhnya, dan apabila dikemudian hari terdapat penyimpangan dan ketidakbenaran, maka saya bersedia menerima sanksi akademik berupa pencabutan gelar yang telah saya peroleh karena karya tulis ini, serta sanksi lainnya sesuai dengan norma dan ketentuan hukum yang berlaku.

Padang: Juni 2014

Saya yang menyatakan,

Anamaryanti

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to almighty God – Allah SWT – who has given her the blessing, strength, health, opportunity and patience to finish this thesis. Besides, this thesis would not be finished without any support, guidance and valuable advices from many people. Therefore, the researcher would like to express her deepest appreciation and thankfulness to:

- Prof. Hermawati Syarif, M.Hum and Dr. Yenni Rozimela M.Ed, Ph.D as her advisors, who have given a great deal of continuous guidance, valuable advices, meaningful contribution, and encouragement in accomplishing this thesis.
- 2. Prof. Dr. H. Anas Yasin M.A, Dr. Refnadi, M. Litt and Dr. Ridwan, M.Sc. Ed, as her contributors who have given many contributions to improve this thesis.
- 3. The director of Graduate Program of State University of Padang and all of staff who provided the supporting facilities as well.
- 4. All lecturers of English education section of State University of Padang who have taught her during study.
- 5. The principal of SMAN 4 Kerinci who had permitted and facilitated the researcher in conducting her research.
- 6. All students of Grage XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci who have cooperated so well as respondents while this research being conducted.
- 7. Her deepest gratitude goes to her beloved father "Jaafar" and mother "Nur Kabbah" and to her husband "Aidil Amin, S.H and her sons (Alhafizh

Nadhira Zikri and Alluthfi Nadhira Zikri) who have patiently prayed, supported, motivated, and encouraged the researcher.

8. All her family and colleagues at English Language Education Section of Graduate Program of State University of Padang enrolled in 2011/2012 for their friendship and encouragement.

Finally, this thesis is expected to give a significant and useful contribution for the development of English education in Indonesian context.

Padang, Juni 2014

Researcher

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRAK	i
ABSTRACT	ii
PERSETUJUAN AKHIR TESIS	iii
PERSETUJUAN KOMISI UJIAN TESIS MAGISTER PENDID	OIKANiv
SURAT PERNYATAAN	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
LIST OF TABLES	xiv
LIST OF GRAPHS	xvi
LIST OF APPENDICES	xvii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	
A. Background of the Problem	1
B. Identification of the Problem	3
C. Limitation of the Problem	4
D. Research Questions	4
E. Purpose of the Research	4
F. Significance of the Research	5
G. Definition of the Key Terms	5
CHAPTER II REVIEW OF THE RELATED LITERATURE	
A. Review of the Related Theories	
1. Writing	6
a. Concept of Writing	6
b. Components of Writing	9
2. Common Problems of Students in Writing Re	
3. Review Text	17
a. Concept of Review Text	17

	b. Components of Review Text	20
	1) Generic Structure	20
	2) Language Features	24
	c. Writing Review text	29
	d. Assessing Writing of Review Text	30
4.	. The Factors Influencing the Students' Problems in Writing	
	Review Text	31
	a. Interference of first laguange	31
	b.The complexity of the target language	32
	c. Lack of knowledge about the writing components	33
B. R	Review of Related Findings	33
C. C	Conceptual Framework	35
	SEARCH METHOD	
A.T	Type of the Research	37
B.D	Data and Source of the data	37
C. I	Instrumentation	38
D.T	echnique of Collecting Data	42
E. Te	Cechnique of Analyzing Data	43
F. P	Procedure of the Research	46
CHAPTER IV FIN	NDINGS AND DISCUSSION	
A. I	Findings	47
1	1. The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text	47
	a. The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text Relate	ed
	to Vocabulary	47
	b. The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text Relate	ed
	to Grammar	53
	c. The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text Relate	ed
	to Generic Sructure	59
	d. The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text Relate	ed

			to Organizing Idea	65
		e.	The Students' Ability in Writing Review Text Related	l
			to Mechanics	71
	2.	Th	e Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	79
		a.	The Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	
			Related to Vocabulary	79
		b.	The Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	
			Related to Grammar	85
		c.	The Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	
			Related to Generic Structure	93
		d.	The Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	
			Related to Organizing Idea	.102
		e.	The Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	
			Related to Mechanics	.107
	3.	Th	e Causes of the Students' Problems in Writing Review	,
		Te	xt	.112
		a.	Interference of First Language	.113
		b.	Complexity of Target Language	.114
		c.	Lack of Knowledge about Writing Components	.115
В.	Di	scus	ssion	.118
	1.	Th	e Students' Ability in Writing Review Text	.118
	2.	Th	e Students' Problems in Writing Review Text	.123
	3.	Ca	uses of the Students' Difficulties in Writing Review	
		Te	xt	.128
C.	Th	e Li	mitation of the Research	131

CHAPTER V CONCLUSION, IMPLICATION AND SUGGESTION	
A. Conclusion	132
B. Implication	133
C. Suggestions	113
BIBLIOGRAPHY	135

LIST OF TABLES

Page
Table 1. Review text indicators
Table 2. Indicators of writing review text
Table 3. Interview indicators for the causes of problems in writing review
text
Table 4. The classification of the levels of students ability in writing review text44
Table 5. The students' ability in writing review text related to vocabulary52
Table 6. The students' ability in writing review text related to grammar58
Table 7. The students' ability in writing review text related to generic structure64
Table 8. The students' ability in writing review text related to organizing idea69
Table 9. The students' ability in writing review text related to mechanics
Table 10. The students' problems in writing review text related to vocabulary84
Table 11. The students' problems in writing review text related to grammar92
Table 12. The students' problems in writing review text related to generic
strcuture101
Table 13. The students' problems in writing review text related to organizing
idea106

Table 14. The students' problems in writing review text related to mechanic	110
Table 15. The students' problems in writing review text	.111
Table 16. The causes of the students' problems in writing review text	.117

LIST OF GRAPHS

	Page
Graph 1. The students' score on writing review text	77
Graph 2. The students' ability in writing review text	78

LIST OF APPENDICES

		page
1.	Appendix 1 Instrument.	139
2.	Appendix 2 Rubrics scoring for writing review text	141
3.	Appendix 3 Students' score in writing review text (Scorer 1)	144
4.	Appendix 4 Students' score in writing review text (Scorer 2)	146
5.	Appendix 5 Students' score in writing review text	148
6.	Appendix 6 Students' ability in writing review text	149
7.	Appendix 7 Students' score in writing review text related to vocabulary	
	(Scorer 1 and Scorer 2	150
8.	Appendix 8 Students' score in writing review text related to vocabulary	151
9.	Appendix 9 Students' score in writing review text related to grammar	
	(Scorer 1)	152
10.	Appendix 10 Students' score in writing review text related to grammar	
	(Scorer 2)	153
11.	Appendix 11 Students' score in writing review text related to grammar.	154
12.	Appendix 12 Students' score in writing review text related to generic	
	structure (Scorer 1)	155
13.	Appendix 13 Students' score in writing review text related to generic	
	Structure (Scorer 2)	156
14.	Appendix 14 Students' score in writing review text related to generic	
	structure	157
15.	Appendix 15 Students' score in writing review text telated to	
	organizing idea (Scorer 1 and Scorer 2)	158
16.	Appendix 16 Students' score in writing review text telated to	
	organizing idea	159
17.	Appendix 17 Students' score in writing review text related to	
	mechanics (Scorer 1)	160
18.	Appendix 18 Students' score in writing review text related to	
	mechanics (Scorer 2)	161

19. Appendix 19 Students' score in writing review text related to
mechanics
20. Appendix 20 The classification of the students' problems in vocabulary
21. Appendix 21 The students' problems in writing review text related to
Vocabulary
22. Appendix 22 List of the students' problems in vocabulary: type 1
Verb
23. Appendix 23 Type 2 : Noun
24. Appendix 24 Type 3 : Adjective
25. Appendix 25 Type 4 : Adverb
26. Appendix 26 The classification of the students' problems in grammar
27. Appendix 27 The students' problems in writing review text related to
Grammar
28. Appendix 28 List of the students' problems in grammar: type 1
Modal
29. Appendix 29 Type 2: noun phrase
30. Appendix 30 Type 3: compound and complex sentence
31. Appendix 31 Type 4: simple present
32. Appendix 32 Type 5 : simple past
33. Appendix 33 The classification of the students' problems in generic
structure
34. Appendix 34 The students' problems in writing review text related to
generic structure
35. Appendix 35 List of the students' problems in generic structure:
Type 1 Incomplete generic structure
36. Appendix 36 Type 2: combination of orientation and interpretative
Recount
37. Appendix 37 Type 3: combination of interpretative recount and
evaluation

38. Appendix 38 List of the students' problems in generic structure: type 4
combination of orientation and evaluation
39. Appendix 39 The classification of the students' problems in
organizing idea
40. Appendix 40 The students' problems in writing review text related to
organizing idea
41. Appendix 41 List of the students' problems in organizing idea: type 1
incomplete idea
42. Appendix 42 Type 2 : paragraph has no idea
43. Appendix 43 Type 3: paragraph has more than one idea
44. Appendix 44 The classification the students' problems in mechanics
45. Appendix 45 The students' problems in writing review text related to
Mechanic
46. Appendix 46 List of the students' problems in mechanic: type 1
spelling
47. Appendix 47 Type 2 : punctuation
48. Appendix 48 The students' problems in writing review text
49. Appendix 49 Interview guide
50. Appendix 50 Data display of the cause of the students' problems in
writing reviewtext related to interference of first language
51. Appendix 51 Data display of the cause of the students' problems in
writing review text related to complexity of the target language
52. Appendix 52 Data display of the cause of the students' problems in
writing review text related to lack of knowledge about writing
components
53. Appendix 53 The causes of the students' problems in writing review
text
54. Appendix 54 Example of interview transciption
JT. ADDONAIA JT LAAIHDIC OI IIICI VICW HAHSCIDHUH

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

A. Background of the Problem

Writing is an essential language skill. Someone is able to express his ideas and thoughts by writing. Through writing, he can restate information that he understands from texts or articles as well as information that he listens to. Moreover, it is also a very useful language skill to deliver information through written communication.

Writing is also important for the students to convey their ideas or messages. Writing is a process of communicating something through paper to a reader. In writing activity, the students are needed to be able to produce an effective and interesting composition, which combine the ability of the students in expressing their ideas in their mind and the students' knowlegde about grammatical patterns.

Since writing is important, there are some types of text which are stated for teaching writing at grade XII, namely: explanation, narrative, discussion and review text. Each text has different purpose, generic structure and language features. Review text is a text that has the purpose to criticize or evaluate an art work or event for a public audience (Sudarwati and Grace, 2006: 190). The text is also used to criticize the events or art works for the reader or listener, such as movies, shows, competitions, etc. It comprises four main organizations; orientation (background information of the text), interpretative recount (summary of an art work), evaluation (personal opinion about an art work), and evaluative

summation. Its characteristics can be seen through its language features. They focus on using modals, noun phrases, compound and complex sentences, simple present tense and simple past tense.

From the researcher's observation, the students faced some problems in writing. Based on the researcher's interview with the English teacher in SMAN 4 Kerinci, the students of class XII IPA still had problems in writing, especially in writing review text. The teacher said that there were some problems of the students in writing review text. First, the students have lack of motivation to write review text. When then teacher asked them to write, they just kept silent, and they did not know what they wanted to write. That's why, if there was a writing task, some of studens liked cheating and need extra time to finish it. Second, the studentsdid not use a good strategy when they were writing review text for example they didn't write the draft and they didn't write the question related to what they wanted to write. Third, the students had less of knowlegde about components of review text. Related to the components of writing review text, the students had problems to use the English vocabulary. Based on the preliminary datawhich were taken from students, it was indicated that 60% of the students used inappropriate words on their writing. For example, one of the students wrote "The man has tall motivation" instead of "The man has high motivation". The data shows that the students got confused in choosing the appropriate words when they wrote a text. The students also found problem in generic structure. The preliminary data from class XII IPA at SMAN 4 Kerinci showed around 40% of the students made errors

in generic structure. Some of the students did not know how to start their writing that reflects the orientation of the text. The student didn't write the background of an art work, they just state the name of an art work without giving the writer of the art work. Another problem related generic structure is in writing evaluation. The students did't give evaluation for the art work, where they didn't state their opinion (judgement) about the weaknesses or strength of an art work. The students just wrote orientation and summary of the art work. They said that it was difficult to give opinion about an art work.

In order to help the students in writing review text, their ability, their problems and the causes of the problems need to be analyzed. Analyzing students' ability in writing review text would help to find out their problems and the causes of their problemsin writing review text. Therefore, the researcher was interested in analyzing the students' ability in writing review text, their problems and the causes of the problems.

B. Identification of the Problem

There are some problems identified in the background of the problems above. First, the students' motivation in writing is still low. Second, the students do not use the good strategy when they are writing review text, it makes the students do not produce good writing. Third, the students have less of knowlegde about components of review text. Therefore, some students do not know what should be done in writing review text and it makes them lazy to write.

C. Limitation of the Problem

Based on the identification of the problem above, the researcher limited the problem on the students' knowlegde about the components of review text by focusing on the students' ability and problems in writing review text at grade XIIIPA SMAN 4 Kerinci.

D. Research Questions

The questions of the research are as follows:

- 1. How is the students' ability in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci?
- 2. What problems do the students have in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci?
- **3.** What are the causes ofthe students' problems in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci?

E. Purpose of the Research

The purpose of the research are:

- 1.to explain the students ability in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci.
- 2.to explain the students' problems in writing a review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci.
- 3. to explain the causes of the students' problems in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci?

F. Sifnificance of The Research

After knowing students' ability, problems and causes of the students' problems in writing review text, the finding of this research are expected to be beneficial for the English teachers as information in developing students' quality in learning English especially in writing review text. So, the teachers can try to guide the students to the right way in writing review text. Moreover, by knowing the students' ability and problems in writing review text, the English teacher can help the students to give judgement into an art work.

Besides, the research can be used as the reference for those who wantto conduct a research in writing, especially in writing review text.

G. Definition of Key Terms

- 1. Review Text is a type oftext which has function to give evaluation to the art work that informs people about its strength and weaknesses.
- 2. Students' ability in writing review text is an ability in producing a text that gives an opinion about an art work by stating its strengths and weaknesses.
- 3. Students' problems in writing review text is the problems that the students face in writing a text that gives an opinion about an art work by stating its strengths and weaknesses.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION, IMPLICATION AND SUGGESTION

A. Conclusion

Based on the data analysis, the students' ability in writing review text at grade XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci was fair. It was showed from the finding that the average score that the students got was 64.84in the range score of 56-65. It indicates that the students' ability in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci wascategorized at fair.

Then,in writing review text the students got problems inusing vocabulary, grammar, generic structure, organizing idea and mechanics. The students' problems in vocabularywere verb, noun, adjective, and adverb. The students' problems in grammar were modal, noun phrase, compound and complex sentence, simple present and simple past. The students' problems in generic structure were incomplete generic structure, combination of orientation, interpretative recount and evaluation. In organizing idea, the students' problems were incomplete paragraph, paragraph that had no idea and paragraph that had more than one idea. The students' problems in mechanics were in using spelling and punctuation.

The students' problems in writing review text were caused by some factors. The factors which caused the students had problems in writing review text were interference of first language, complexity of target language and lack of knowledge about writing components.

B. Implication

There are some implications related to the finding of the reserach. They are:

- Interference of first language is one of the sources of the students' problem
 in writing review text. Transferring languages which have different words
 and rules to construct a sentence make the students had problems in writing
 review text.
- 2. Complexity of the target language can be as a factor that causes the students' problems in writing review text. In fact, by mastering the rules of English can help the students to understand English well.
- 3. Lack of knowledge about the writing components can influence the students to get problems in writing review text. In fact, the implementation of an interesting strategy in teaching review text can help the students to understand the writing components.

C. Suggestion

Based on the findings and conclusions of this research, the researcher would like to give some suggestion as follows:

- The students should master the rules of English. So that, they can avoid the interference of of their language, and they can know the rules for the complexity of English.
- 2. The English teachers are suggested to explain the writing components of review text by using good mediain order to get the students' understanding about the writing components of review text.

3. Other researchers are suggested to continue this research in order to to getthe solutions for the students' problems in writing review text.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Al-Habri, Abdullah Mohammed. 2007. The Problems of Secondary Students in Written English at Tenth Grade Students in Ajloun School. *International Journal of Learning and Development*. 2(2). 280-299.
- Arikunto, Suharsimi. 2006. *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik Edisi Ke-VI*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Azar, Betty S.2002. *Understanding and Using English Grammar*. New York: Pearson Education.
- Babala, H.2012. Effects of Process-Genre Based Approach on the Written English Performance of Computer Science Students in a Nigerian Polytechnic. *Journal of Education and Practice*.3(6).1-30.
- Bahri, Saiful and Sugeng, Bambang. 2009. Problems in Writing Review Text of the Class XII in SMAN 1 Selong East Lombok West Nusa Tenggara in the School Year 2008/2009. East Lombok: The State Islamic University of Lombok. (Unpublished Thesis).
- Beare, Kenneth.2010. Teaching Writing Skills. *International Education Journal*. 1(1), 22-31.
- Berg, Bruce L. 2001. *Qualitative Research Method for the Social Science*. New York: A Pearson Education Company.
- Blachard, K and Root, C. 2003. *Ready to Write, A first Text Composition*: Third Edition. New York: Pearson Education Inc.
- Brookes, Arthur. 1990. Writing for Study Purposes. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brown, H. Douglas. 2004. *Language Assessment; Principle and Classroom Practices*. New York: Pearson Education Inc.
- Carrol, Joyce and Wilson, Edwar. 1993. *Acts of Teaching: How to Teach Writing*. Englewood: Teacher Idea Press.
- Colford, Ian. 2000. How to Write a Book Review. European Journal of Social Science. 4(9). 45-58.